

# INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL FOR LEGAL RESEARCH AND ANALYSIS



Open Access, Refereed Journal Multi Disciplinary  
Peer Reviewed Edition :

[www.ijlra.com](http://www.ijlra.com)

## **DISCLAIMER**

No part of this publication may be reproduced or copied in any form by any means without prior written permission of Managing Editor of IJLRA. The views expressed in this publication are purely personal opinions of the authors and do not reflect the views of the Editorial Team of IJLRA.

Though every effort has been made to ensure that the information in Volume 2 Issue 7 is accurate and appropriately cited/referenced, neither the Editorial Board nor IJLRA shall be held liable or responsible in any manner whatsoever for any consequences for any action taken by anyone on the basis of information in the Journal.

Copyright © International Journal for Legal Research & Analysis

IJLRA

## **EDITORIAL TEAM**

### **EDITORS**



### **Megha Middha**

*Megha Middha, Assistant Professor of Law in Mody University of Science and Technology, Lakshmangarh, Sikar*

*Megha Middha, is working as an Assistant Professor of Law in Mody University of Science and Technology, Lakshmangarh, Sikar (Rajasthan). She has an experience in the teaching of almost 3 years. She has completed her graduation in BBA LL.B (H) from Amity University, Rajasthan (Gold Medalist) and did her post-graduation (LL.M in Business Laws) from NLSIU, Bengaluru. Currently, she is enrolled in a Ph.D. course in the Department of Law at Mohanlal Sukhadia University, Udaipur (Rajasthan). She wishes to excel in academics and research and contribute as much as she can to society. Through her interactions with the students, she tries to inculcate a sense of deep thinking power in her students and enlighten and guide them to the fact how they can bring a change to the society*

### **Dr. Samrat Datta**

*Dr. Samrat Datta Seedling School of Law and Governance, Jaipur National University, Jaipur. Dr. Samrat Datta is currently associated with Seedling School of Law and Governance, Jaipur National University, Jaipur. Dr. Datta has completed his graduation i.e., B.A.LL.B. from Law College Dehradun, Hemvati Nandan Bahuguna Garhwal University, Srinagar, Uttarakhand. He is an alumnus of KIIT University, Bhubaneswar where he pursued his post-graduation (LL.M.) in Criminal Law and subsequently completed his Ph.D. in Police Law and Information Technology from the Pacific Academy of Higher Education and Research University, Udaipur in 2020. His area of interest and research is Criminal and Police Law. Dr. Datta has a teaching experience of 7 years in various law schools across North India and has held administrative positions like Academic Coordinator, Centre Superintendent for Examinations, Deputy Controller of Examinations, Member of the Proctorial Board*



## Dr. Namita Jain



*Head & Associate Professor*

*School of Law, JECRC University, Jaipur Ph.D. (Commercial Law) LL.M., UGC -NET Post Graduation Diploma in Taxation law and Practice, Bachelor of Commerce.*

*Teaching Experience: 12 years, AWARDS AND RECOGNITION of Dr. Namita Jain are - ICF Global Excellence Award 2020 in the category of educationalist by I Can Foundation, India. India Women Empowerment Award in the category of "Emerging Excellence in Academics by Prime Time & Utkrisht Bharat Foundation, New Delhi.(2020). Conferred in FL Book of Top 21 Record Holders in the category of education by Fashion Lifestyle Magazine, New Delhi. (2020). Certificate of Appreciation for organizing and managing the Professional Development Training Program on IPR in Collaboration with Trade Innovations Services, Jaipur on March 14th, 2019*

## Mrs.S.Kalpana

*Assistant professor of Law*

*Mrs.S.Kalpana, presently Assistant professor of Law, VelTech Rangarajan Dr. Sagunthala R & D Institute of Science and Technology, Avadi. Formerly Assistant professor of Law, Vels University in the year 2019 to 2020, Worked as Guest Faculty, Chennai Dr.Ambedkar Law College, Pudupakkam. Published one book. Published 8 Articles in various reputed Law Journals. Conducted 1 Moot court competition and participated in nearly 80 National and International seminars and webinars conducted on various subjects of Law. Did ML in Criminal Law and Criminal Justice Administration. 10 paper presentations in various National and International seminars. Attended more than 10 FDP programs. Ph.D. in Law pursuing.*



## Avinash Kumar



*learning.*

*Avinash Kumar has completed his Ph.D. in International Investment Law from the Dept. of Law & Governance, Central University of South Bihar. His research work is on "International Investment Agreement and State's right to regulate Foreign Investment." He qualified UGC-NET and has been selected for the prestigious ICSSR Doctoral Fellowship. He is an alumnus of the Faculty of Law, University of Delhi. Formerly he has been elected as Students Union President of Law Centre-1, University of Delhi. Moreover, he completed his LL.M. from the University of Delhi (2014-16), dissertation on "Cross-border Merger & Acquisition"; LL.B. from the University of Delhi (2011-14), and B.A. (Hons.) from Maharaja Agrasen College, University of Delhi. He has also obtained P.G. Diploma in IPR from the Indian Society of International Law, New Delhi. He has qualified UGC - NET examination and has been awarded ICSSR - Doctoral Fellowship. He has published six-plus articles and presented 9 plus papers in national and international seminars/conferences. He participated in several workshops on research methodology and teaching and*

## **ABOUT US**

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL FOR LEGAL RESEARCH & ANALYSIS

ISSN

2582-6433 is an Online Journal is Monthly, Peer Review, Academic Journal, Published online, that seeks to provide an interactive platform for the publication of Short Articles, Long Articles, Book Review, Case Comments, Research Papers, Essay in the field of Law & Multidisciplinary issue. Our aim is to upgrade the level of interaction and discourse about contemporary issues of law. We are eager to become a highly cited academic publication, through quality contributions from students, academics, professionals from the industry, the bar and the bench. INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL FOR LEGAL RESEARCH & ANALYSIS ISSN 2582-6433 welcomes contributions from all legal branches, as long as the work is original, unpublished and is in consonance with the submission guidelines.

**DISSECTING THE RESERVATION DILEMMA: AN  
ANALYTICAL EXAMINATION OF ITS IMPERATIVE  
OR DISPENSABILITY IN THE TAPESTRY OF  
SOCIOPOLITICAL DISCOURSE**

AUTHORED BY - MISHKA PASWAN

B.A.LL.B

Amity University Patna

**ABSTRACT**

This article i.e "Dissecting the Reservation Dilemma: An Analytical Examination of its Imperative or Dispensability in the Tapestry of Sociopolitical Discourse" careful investigation aims to dissect the layers that make up this sociopolitical discourse, focusing on the complex and multidimensional problem of reservations. By exploring the societal aspects, economic ramifications, and historical background, the research seeks to offer a thorough grasp of the reserve conundrum.

By incorporating Baba Saheb Ambedkar's insightful perspective, the research contextualizes reservations as a means to rectify historical injustices and promote social equity. Ambedkar's motive, centred on empowering marginalized communities, serves as a guiding principle throughout the analysis. Through a critical analytical lens, the study scrutinizes the complex interplay of factors surrounding reservations, aiming to contribute substantively to the ongoing discourse.

By providing a thorough analysis of whether reservations are necessary to redress societal inequities or if they are no longer necessary in the current socio-political environment, the goal is to make a significant contribution to the continuing conversation. By use of this comprehensive analysis, the goal of this article is to provide a deeper understanding of how reservations affect and shape society as a whole closing it with the insightful words of DR. B.R. Ambedkar.

*"Political power cannot be a panacea for the ills of the social order. The real seat of power is social. If you want to distribute power in society, you must repair the social system and then alone*

*can you distribute power."*

## INTRODUCTION

Affirmative action in the shape of India's reservation system has been the focus of much discussion and analysis in the sociopolitical discourse. It was designed as a way to make right for past wrongs and provide historically marginalised groups participation in the political, economic, and educational spheres. The system dates back to the second century B.C. and was redesigned in its current form by William Hunter and Jyotirao Phule in 1882. Its main beneficiaries are the Scheduled Castes (SC), Scheduled Tribes (ST), and Other Backward Classes (OBC).

Praise has been given to the reservation system for levelling the playing field for underprivileged groups and closing the gap between the higher and lower classes. But it has also drawn criticism for perhaps lowering applicant calibre and turning it into a tool for politicians to acquire a bank of votes. Concerns have also been raised about the reservation system's potential to benefit others at the expense of castes who ought to benefit the most.

The conversation around reserves has moved in recent years to focus on the economic standard, with calls for quotas for the economically disadvantaged segments of society (EWS). This has prompted debate over the continued applicability of the quota policy in a purportedly casteless society. Opponents contend that reservation laws serve to maintain and deepen caste distinctions rather than lessen their influence. The objective of this study is to analyse the reservation issue and determine if it is necessary or unnecessary in the context of sociopolitical discourse. Utilizing an exhaustive examination of the historical backdrop, present-day execution, and the reservation system's potential in the future, it aims to offer a comprehensive grasp of this intricate matter. One complex aspect of today's sociopolitical debate is the reservation conundrum, which serves as a reminder of the constant fight for social fairness and fair representation. Reservation policies, which have their roots in past injustices and are intended to remedy structural imbalances, have gained prominence in the moulding of society. This section gives a quick summary of the reservation issue, emphasises how crucial it is in the current sociopolitical climate, and shows how Baba Saheb Ambedkar's revolutionary ideas are still relevant today<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> *Dr Ambedkar and his thoughts on reservations - HinduPost. <https://hindupost.in/history/dr-ambedkar-and-his-thoughts-on-reservations/>. Last visited:- 2nd December 2023, 20:05.*

### 1. The Preference Conundrum:

The reservation conundrum is a multifaceted collection of problems centred around affirmative action laws intended to make up for past wrongs. Reservation rules, which were first implemented to support underprivileged areas, have developed into a divisive topic that sparks discussions about social justice<sup>2</sup>, representation, and the very structure of meritocracy.

### 2. Significance in the Present Sociopolitical Environment:

Reservation rules are extremely important in the ever-changing context of modern civilization. These laws serve as engines for the destruction of deeply ingrained systems of discrimination<sup>3</sup>, the promotion of social inclusion, and the creation of opportunities for historically underprivileged groups to actively engage in the advancement of their country<sup>4</sup>.

The Indian Constitution was primarily drafted by the eminent lawyer, social reformer, and principal architect Baba Saheb Ambedkar, who left a lasting legacy. His forward-thinking opinions about reservation laws continue to serve as a benchmark in modern debate, influencing our comprehension of the purposes and intentions of affirmative action<sup>5</sup>.

The foundation of Ambedkar's support for reservation policy is his emphasis on social justice. He championed policies that would right historical injustices because of his astute analysis of ingrained social structures and discriminatory practices. Ambedkar painstakingly detailed the necessity of taking aggressive steps to uplift the marginalised and guarantee their equitable participation in social matters in his key essay, "Annihilation of Caste<sup>6</sup>."

The revolutionary power of reservation systems is shown by Ambedkar's stated philosophy of equality. Dr Ambedkar realised that to elevate historically marginalised populations as a result of caste-based discrimination, societal reform requires not only legal and constitutional protections but also affirmative action<sup>7</sup>. According to Ambedkar, reservation laws serve as a tool to free

---

<sup>2</sup> Press Information Bureau. (n.d.). Ambedkar Jayanti. [Online] Available at: <https://static.pib.gov.in/WriteReadData/specificdocs/documents/2023/apr/doc2023413180601.pdf> [Accessed [2<sup>nd</sup> December 2023]][20:12].

<sup>3</sup> Chakraborty, L., & Rawal, V. (2018). Social Exclusion, Reservations, and the Persistence of Caste. Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Communication.

<sup>4</sup> Deshpande, S. (2006). Affirmative Action in India and the United States. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 41(49), 4981-4986.

<sup>5</sup> Dreze, J., & Sen, A. (2013). *An Uncertain Glory: India and its Contradictions*. Princeton University Press.

<sup>6</sup> Ambedkar, B. R. (1990). *Annihilation of Caste*. Verso.

<sup>7</sup> Zelliot, E. (2005). Ambedkar's Role in the Making of the Indian Constitution. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 40(49), 5117-5122.

people from the chains of inequity and give everyone equal access to opportunities.

Ambedkar's support for reservations as a weapon for socio-economic and political empowerment, rather than just as a means of redress, demonstrates his dedication to the empowerment of marginalised populations<sup>8</sup>. His insight was that real empowerment goes beyond symbolic representation and involves giving marginalised populations access to political, economic, and educational opportunities so they may actively participate in the advancement of their country. Policymakers and activists alike continue to be guided by Ambedkar's ideas as a moral compass in the current social environment.

His opinions on reservations are still relevant today, as seen by the discussions surrounding affirmative action across the world<sup>9</sup>. Through the integration of Ambedkar's ideas into the current conversation, society may strive to establish a setting in which everyone can benefit from progress, regardless of past setbacks<sup>10</sup>.

To sum up, Baba Saheb Ambedkar's groundbreaking ideas on reservation laws are still relevant today and serve as a guiding principle for people who are dedicated to promoting social justice, equality, and the total empowerment of historically marginalised populations. His continuous relevance emphasises the necessity of upholding the values he promoted to guarantee that inclusive growth becomes ingrained in society as a whole.

## **1. THE INTENTION BEHIND THE INTRODUCTION OF RESERVATION**

India's implementation of reservation laws is a sophisticated reaction to a long history of deeply ingrained societal injustices. Driven by a confluence of pragmatic and moral imperatives, the reservation system was designed as a means of addressing and redressing the systemic inequities that historically marginalised populations have experienced in important societal spheres including employment, political representation, and education.

The landmark research "The Legacy of Social Exclusion: A Correspondence Study of Job

---

<sup>8</sup> Omvedt, G. (2008). *Dalits and the Democratic Revolution: Dr. Ambedkar and the Dalit Movement in Colonial India*. Sage Publications.

<sup>9</sup> Brass, P. R. (1995). *The Politics of India Since Independence*. Cambridge University Press.

<sup>10</sup> Jaffrelot, C. (2005). Dr. Ambedkar and Untouchability: Analysing and Fighting Caste. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 40(4), 311-321.

Discrimination in India<sup>11</sup>," by Sukhadeo Thorat and Paul Attewell, is essential to comprehending the pervasive discrimination that drove the necessity for legislative action. To perform a field experiment, this extensive research submitted three separate applications in response to job postings in major English dailies: one as an applicant from an upper-caste Hindu community, another as a Third as Muslim, and Dalit. An empirical analysis of discriminatory practices at the outset of the job application process was made possible by the experiment's clever design.

Based on a thorough statistical analysis, Thorat and Attewell's study's conclusions showed that discriminatory practices exist even at the beginning of the application process. The experiment's findings highlight the glaring realities of widespread inequality and social injustice and shed light on the difficulties historically marginalised groups have had in finding work. The study clarifies the subtle but significant ways in which prejudice functions in the professional world by methodically examining reactions to job applications based on caste and religious identities<sup>12</sup>.

The important pillar of this analysis is its ability to demonstrate the need for reservation policies by presenting concrete proof of the structural obstacles marginalised populations have while trying to get work. The results demonstrate that the reservation system was a calculated intervention meant to destroy deeply embedded discriminatory practices rather than just a reaction to past injustices<sup>13</sup>. Essentially, Thorat and Attewell's study adds a great deal to the larger conversation over reservations by highlighting the necessity of taking proactive steps to right past wrongs and eliminate discriminatory systems in modern Indian culture<sup>14</sup>.

- Empowerment of Marginalized Communities:

Reservation laws have played a pivotal role in bringing about revolutionary shifts in traditionally marginalised populations. This section explores the complex effects of these policies, explaining how they give marginalised people vital access to political representation, work, and education, encouraging their active involvement in the advancement of society<sup>15</sup>.

---

<sup>11</sup> Thorat, S., & Attewell, P. (2007). The Legacy of Social Exclusion: A Correspondence Study of Job Discrimination in India. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 42(41), 4141-4145.

<sup>12</sup> Thorat, S., & Attewell, P. (2007). The Legacy of Social Exclusion: A Correspondence Study of Job Discrimination in India. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 42(41), 4141-4145.

<sup>13</sup> Shah, A. M. (2006). The Politics of Reservation: The Case of Gujarat. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 41(14), 1365-1371.

<sup>14</sup> Beteille, A. (2003). *The Backward Classes in Contemporary India*. Oxford University Press.

<sup>15</sup> Caste in Indian Politics: An Analysis and its Implications. [<https://ijcrt.org/papers/IJCRT2308252.pdf>]. [Accessed on 2<sup>nd</sup> of December 2023][21:06]

i. Education Access:

Facilitating greater access to education is one of the main ways that reservation laws strengthen marginalised populations. Reservation seats in educational institutions guarantee that people from historically underprivileged backgrounds can pursue higher education. This frees people from the bonds of intergenerational illiteracy and gives them the information and abilities needed to successfully negotiate the challenges of modern life<sup>16</sup>.

ii. Job opportunities

Reservation regulations in India are essential for rectifying historical disparities in the labour force by guaranteeing fair job opportunities. These policies support economic empowerment by designating a portion of positions in the public and commercial sectors for members of marginalised communities.

As a result, there are fewer income gaps and marginalised groups' socioeconomic standing is improved<sup>1</sup>. Employment reservations can contribute to a lower poverty and inequality rate<sup>17</sup>, a higher standard of life, and equitable access to resources and other opportunities for the less fortunate segments of society.

Minority groups are more represented in politics, the workforce, and educational institutions because of the reservation system. It's important to remember, meanwhile, that the reservation system has also come under fire for perhaps lowering the calibre of candidates and turning into a tool used by politicians to increase their vote totals. Concerns have also been raised about the reservation system's potential to benefit others at the expense of castes who ought to benefit the most.

iii. POLITICAL REPRESENTATION

In India, reservation regulations have a broader influence on politics by guaranteeing that marginalised populations are represented proportionately. People from historically underrepresented backgrounds can actively engage in the political decision-making process thanks to reserved seats in legislative bodies. This serves to both amplify their views and advance

---

<sup>16</sup> Government of India. (2018). All India Survey on Higher Education. Ministry of Education, Department of Higher Education.

<sup>17</sup> Thorat, S., & Newman, K. (2007). Reservation in Private Sector: A Comprehensive Policy Framework. Economic and Political Weekly, 42(33), 3443-3448.

inclusive and representative governance.

A 1993 constitutional amendment established a reservation system for women that rotates village leader posts, with 33 per cent of these positions going to women every election<sup>18</sup>. Women now have more influence in local government. Women who have been elected have improved their leadership abilities and taken an active part in healthcare initiatives, literacy campaigns, and programmes aimed at reducing poverty.

Minority groups have more representation in politics because of the reservation system. It's important to remember, meanwhile, that the reservation system has furthermore come under fire for perhaps lowering the standard of candidates and turning them into a tool for politicians to increase their support base<sup>19</sup>. Concerns have also been raised about the reservation system's potential to benefit others at the expense of castes who ought to benefit the most<sup>20</sup>.

## **BABA SAHEB AMBEDKAR VISION**

Baba Saheb Ambedkar's awareness of the historical background of caste-based discrimination in India is a fundamental component of his vision for quota policies<sup>21</sup>. Ambedkar saw firsthand the firmly established social structures that consistently excluded other populations as a lawyer, social reformer, and primary drafter of the Indian Constitution. His support of reserve laws resulted from his deep awareness of the atrocities these tribes had endured throughout history<sup>21</sup>.

Ambedkar's ground-breaking essay, "Annihilation of Caste," provides a fundamental source that explains the background and motivations behind his support for reservations. Ambedkar criticises the caste system and makes the case in this essay for a drastic reconstruction of society to eradicate caste-based discrimination<sup>22</sup>. The text is a manifesto for the revolutionary movement and demonstrates his passionate dedication to social justice. He aimed to effect changes.

---

<sup>18</sup>Women's Movement in Indian Politics: Creating a Path to Gender Equality.... This article discusses the Kritika Joshi Women's Reservation Bill in India...

<sup>19</sup> Palshikar, S. (2006). *Democracy in India: Changing Patterns of Participation*. Oxford University Press.

<sup>20</sup> Women's Representation In India: Reservations And Beyond. Women's representation in reservations and beyond in India: <https://feminisminindia.com/2021/09/16/>.

<sup>21</sup> Annihilation of Caste by B.R. Ambedkar - Amazon.in. <https://www.amazon.in/Annihilation-Caste-Hardcover-Library-Ambedkar/dp/9390492750>.

<sup>22</sup> Thorat, S., & Attewell, P. (2007). *The Legacy of Social Exclusion: A Correspondence Study of Job Discrimination in India*. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 42(41), 4141-4145.

Ambedkar emphasises the idea that social transformation must come before political and religious reform in "Annihilation of Caste," using examples of the oppression that upper-caste Hindus inflicted upon the untouchable population of India. He calls on Hindus to acknowledge that one caste is unfit to dominate another caste and emphasises the need to rebuild Hindu civilization and abolish the caste system<sup>23</sup>. In this seminal speech, Ambedkar exposes the error of socialists. While he does not oppose socialism, he does think that Indian workers would never join together to support economic change and launch a socialist revolution<sup>2</sup>. They will never come together on any front because they can never truly sense equality, fraternity, and justice. till the caste system is in place.

The opinions expressed by Ambedkar on quota policies and his criticism of the caste system in "Annihilation of Caste"<sup>24</sup> offer a crucial perspective that helps us comprehend both the historical background and the present discussion around reservation laws in India.

- Visionary Principles:

Ambedkar's visionary ideals, which were based on the conviction that structural action was necessary to free society from the chains of social inequity, propelled his advocacy for reservation policy. His goal went beyond simply making amends for past wrongs; it sought to level the playing field so that members of underprivileged groups might actively contribute to the development of their country.

Ambedkar explains his economic philosophy in "The Problem of the Rupee: Its Origin and Its Solution," highlighting the need for economic empowerment in elevating marginalised populations<sup>25</sup>. His emphasis on the creation of educational institutions like as the People's Education Society is indicative of his conviction in the transforming potential of education.

Ambedkar's endeavours to guarantee political representation for underrepresented people serve as a further embodiment of his visionary beliefs. The guarded Legislative seats served as a tool for historically marginalised groups to gain power and influence over governance and policy

---

<sup>23</sup> Ambedkar, B. R. (1929). *The Problem of the Rupee: Its Origin and Its Solution*.

<sup>24</sup> Palshikar, S. (2006). *Democracy in India: Changing Patterns of Participation*. Oxford University Press.

<sup>25</sup> Kundu, A., & Chatterjee, R. (2004). Caste-based Reservations and Human Development in India. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 39(11), 1137-1143.

decisions, in addition to providing a measure of numerical representation<sup>26</sup>.

His insight in identifying the enduring necessity of affirmative action is evident in the continuous policy deliberations, legal exchanges, and arguments surrounding reservation rules.

### **A Critical Examination of Reservations' Current Significance.**

Reservations' continued relevance in modern India is a subject of great scrutiny, requiring a rigorous analysis that takes into account both advantages and disadvantages. This analysis, which draws from a variety of academic publications, policy papers, and research projects, aims to present a thorough examination of the current reserve situation.

As noted in the "Report of the Oversight Committee on the Implementation of Reservation in AIIMS," one of the main benefits of reservations is their contribution to historically marginalised minorities' enhanced access to educational and job opportunities<sup>27</sup>. This beneficial influence also includes promoting diversity, making schools more welcoming, and giving those from disadvantaged backgrounds a voice. As stated in the "National Policy on Reservation for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in Direct Recruitment in Civil Posts and Services of the Government of India," reservation policies are viewed as tools of social justice and empowerment, grounded in the ideals upheld by visionaries such as Baba Saheb Ambedkar. But some disagree, especially about worries about undermining meritocracy, as discussed.

extensively in Guha's work "India After Gandhi"<sup>28</sup>, where the possible influence of reservations on the merit-based selection procedure is examined. Furthermore, the research "The Legacy of Social Exclusion: A Correspondence Study of Job Discrimination in India" by Thorat and Attewell emphasises the detrimental feature of possible stigmatisation and stereotyping of people from restricted groups. The "Economic Survey of India 2022–23" emphasises reservations' relevance in addressing economic disparities and preserving contemporary relevance despite criticisms. Reservations are important because they increase economic empowerment by providing opportunities for skill development and employment in sectors where historically marginalised communities are underrepresented. Furthermore, as Palshikar discusses in

---

<sup>26</sup> Thorat, S., & Attewell, P. (2007). The Legacy of Social Exclusion: A Correspondence Study of Job Discrimination in India. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 42(41), 4141-4145.

<sup>27</sup> Guha, R. (2007). *India After Gandhi: The History of the World's Largest Democracy*.

<sup>28</sup> Guha, R. (2007). *India After Gandhi: The History of the World's Largest Democracy*.

"Democracy," reservations are essential to guaranteeing political representation and promoting a more inclusive democratic process.

in India: Changing Patterns of Participation," which reflects the country's diverse culture<sup>29</sup>. In summary, a thorough comprehension of the current significance of reservations demands a fair evaluation of both their advantages and disadvantages, recognising their critical role in correcting past wrongs, advancing social justice, and encouraging self-determination, while simultaneously addressing issues with meritocracy and possible stigmatisation in the developing sociopolitical discourse of modern-day India.

### **The Complex Interplay of Historical Legacies, Societal Perceptions, and Political Realities in India.**

The complicated discourse surrounding the reservation controversy in India is a result of the many variables that contribute to its complexity. With an emphasis on the complex role played by political dynamics, this investigation aims to disentangle the many factors impacting the discourse around reservations. Examining cultural attitudes, historical backgrounds, and the changing political scene, this conversation seeks to explore all the facets that contribute to the complex and sometimes disputed character of reserves.

It is necessary to go into historical backgrounds to fully appreciate the complexity of the reserve issue. Reservations had their origins in the long-standing, discriminatory caste system, which created social hierarchies and marginalised some people<sup>30</sup>. Reservations, which are a type of affirmative action, were created in reaction to correct these past wrongs, guaranteeing populations that had long suffered from institutional discrimination fair access to jobs, education, and political participation.

The current complexity of the reservation discourse is based on the historical background, which weaves a rich tapestry that connects the past and present and shapes the ongoing narrative of equality and inclusion in India's geopolitical environment.

---

<sup>29</sup> Palshikar, S. (2020). Democracy in India: Changing Patterns of Participation. .

<sup>30</sup> Thorat, S., & Attewell, P. (Year). "The Legacy of Social Exclusion: A Correspondence Study of Job Discrimination in India." *Economic and Political Weekly*, 42(41), 4141-4145.

The Indian reservation system has been the focus of much discussion and analysis in the social discourse. It was intended to serve as a means of redressing past wrongs and giving historically marginalised people representation in the political, economic, and educational spheres. Scheduled Castes (SC), Scheduled Tribes (ST), and Other Backward Classes (OBC) are the main beneficiaries of the system, which has its origins in the second century B.C., with William Hunter and Jyotirao Phule introducing the contemporary version in 1882<sup>31</sup>.

The reservation system has received praise for closing the class divide and giving underprivileged groups an even playing field. It has, however, also come under fire for perhaps lowering the calibre of candidates and turning into a tool for politicians to increase their support bases. In addition, there are worries that the reservation system is benefiting others rather than the castes who ought to be the real beneficiaries.

The conversation about reservations has changed in recent years to focus more on the economic standard, with calls for quotas for the economically disadvantaged segments of society (EWS). Due to this, some have questioned if the reservation system is still in place. pertinent in a society that is purportedly headed towards carelessness<sup>32</sup>. Opponents contend that quota laws serve to maintain and exacerbate caste divides rather than lessen the influence of caste.

The objective is to analyse the reservation conundrum and determine if it is essential or unnecessary in the context of sociopolitical debate. It aims to give a nuanced knowledge of this complicated problem by a thorough examination of the historical background, present implementation, and potential future developments of the reservation system<sup>33</sup>.

- Societal Perceptions and Dynamics:

Diverse and sometimes at-odds cultural opinions add levels of complexity to the discussion over reservations. Although reservations are intended to be a remedial mechanism to redress historical injustices, opinions within society on their usefulness and significance are quite diverse.

---

<sup>31</sup> The Legacy of Social Exclusion - JSTOR Home. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/40276548>. [Accessed, 2<sup>nd</sup> of december 2023],[22:59]

<sup>32</sup> The Legacy of Social Exclusion - Ambedkar King Study Circle. <https://akscusa.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/08/ThoratAttwellSocialExclusion.pdf>. [Accessed, 2<sup>nd</sup> of December 2023],[22:59]

<sup>33</sup> The Reservation System in India - Georgetown University. [https://repository.library.georgetown.edu/bitstream/handle/10822/557891/Retna\\_georgetown\\_0076M\\_11864.pdf](https://repository.library.georgetown.edu/bitstream/handle/10822/557891/Retna_georgetown_0076M_11864.pdf). [Accessed, 2<sup>nd</sup> of december 2023],[23:06]

Thorat and Attewell's comprehensive study, "The Legacy of Social Exclusion: A Correspondence Study of Job Discrimination in India," offers a fascinating viewpoint on this problem<sup>2</sup>. Based on a field experiment, the study's authors responded to job postings in prominent English daily by submitting three applications each call: one from an upper-caste Hindu applicant, one from a Dalit applicant, and one from a Muslim applicant<sup>34</sup>. They discovered through statistical research that biased procedures are in place even during the application process's initial phase. This underlines the difficulties in obtaining total social endorsement of the equality ideals.

The complex relationships between cultural sentiments and the political factors that influence the direction of the reserve discourse occasionally collide. For example, the reservation system has come under fire for perhaps lowering the calibre of candidates and turning it into a tool for politicians to increase their support bases. Furthermore, there are worries that the reservation system is benefiting others rather than the castes who ought to be the real beneficiaries. The reserve discussion is a complicated and nuanced conversation because of the cultural attitudes and processes that add layers of complexity<sup>35</sup>. Comprehending these intricacies is crucial for an exhaustive examination of the Indian reservation system.

- Political Dynamics:

The political aspect of the dispute over reservations is at the core of the intricacy. Reservations are a powerful political instrument that was once intended to address historical injustices. Political parties use reserved language skillfully to appease a variety of constituencies and win over voters.

This complex link between reservations and political representation is explored in depth by Palshikar's study in "Democracy in India: Changing Patterns of Participation"<sup>36</sup>. It serves as an example of how political forces influence how the argument evolves<sup>12</sup>. The political factors that bind reserves create layers of complexity and frequently deviate from the initial goal of redressing historical wrongs.

---

<sup>34</sup> The Legacy of Social Exclusion - Ambedkar King Study Circle. <https://akscusa.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/08/ThoratAttwellSocialExclusion.pdf>. [Accessed, 2<sup>nd</sup> of December 2023, [23:00]

<sup>35</sup> Reservation as a political imperative - Frontline - The Hindu. <https://frontline.thehindu.com/the-nation/reservation-as-a-political-imperative/article32404792.ece>. [Accessed, 2<sup>nd</sup> of December 2023, [23:02]

<sup>36</sup> Reservation as a political imperative - Frontline - The Hindu. <https://frontline.thehindu.com/the-nation/reservation-as-a-political-imperative/article32404792.ece>. [Accessed, 2<sup>nd</sup> of December 2023, [23:09]

According to Indian legislation, reservation is a type of affirmative action in which a certain percentage of seats are set aside in public sector organisations, unions for the socially and educationally disadvantaged communities that are underrepresented in these services and institutions, including state civil services, unions and state government departments, and all public and private educational institutions, except religious and linguistic minority educational institutions<sup>37</sup>.

However, vote-bank politics has a significant influence on how the reservation is applied and carried out in India<sup>6</sup>. Reservations were only permitted by the Indian Constitution for socially and educationally disadvantaged groups. But in India, it shifted from being a class-based reservation to one based on caste. The political aspects of India's reservation system complicate the discussion of reservations even more. Comprehending these dynamics is crucial for an exhaustive examination of the Indian reservation system.<sup>38</sup>

- Intersectionality of Factors:

The difficult matter of the Indian reserve controversy stems from the intersectionality of several causes. Political concerns, cultural views, and historical injustices all combine to produce a complex and multifaceted conversation.

The foundational element of the reservation system is historical injustice. Certain populations experienced marginalisation as a result of the highly ingrained, discriminatory caste system, which perpetuated social hierarchy. To right these past wrongs, affirmative action—embodied in reservations—arose, guaranteeing populations that had long suffered from institutional discrimination fair access to jobs, education, and political participation<sup>39</sup>.

The reserve discussion is further complicated by societal attitudes. Although reservations are intended to be a remedial mechanism to redress previous injustices, opinions within society on their usefulness and significance differ greatly. "The Legacy of Social Exclusion: A

---

<sup>37</sup> Political Reservation and Substantive Representation: Evidence from .... <https://gap.hks.harvard.edu/political-reservation-and-substantive-representation-evidence-indian-village-councils>. . [Accessed, 2<sup>nd</sup> of December 2023],[23:10]

<sup>38</sup> REVISED: An Analysis of Reservation in India - Law Times Journal. <https://lawtimesjournal.in/an-analysis-of-reservation-in-india/>. [Accessed, 2<sup>nd</sup> of December 2023],[23:16]

<sup>39</sup> ) Caste in Indian Politics: An Analysis and its Implications. [<https://ijcrt.org/papers/IJCRT2308252.pdf>]. [Accessed, 2<sup>nd</sup> of December 2023],[23:20]

Correspondence Study of Job Discrimination in India," a research by Thorat and Attewell, offers a fascinating viewpoint on this problem.

The complexities of the reserve argument are heightened by political concerns. Reservations are a powerful political instrument that was once intended to address historical injustices. Political parties use the reserve rhetoric to their advantage to appease a variety of communities and win over voters.

A government attempt to manage this intersectionality may be seen in the "National Policy on Reservation for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in Direct Recruitment in Civil Posts and Services of the Government of India". It highlights the dedication to using policy implementation to right past wrongs. But the reality on the ground reflects the continuous battle to strike a balance between these. "The Legacy of Social Exclusion: A Correspondence Study of Job Discrimination in India," a research by Thorat and Attewell, offers an illum overlapping variables. The intersectionality of these several variables is what gives birth to the reserve debate's particular complexity. Comprehending these intricacies is crucial for an exhaustive examination of the Indian reservation system<sup>40</sup>.

- Challenges and Controversies:

There has been constant discussion and controversy around the complicated and varied topic of reservations in India. The reservation system has changed throughout time and has been impacted by several causes. It was first implemented as a kind of affirmative action to remedy past injustices and socioeconomic disparities<sup>41</sup>.

Ramachandra Guha critically analyses the effects of reservations on the meritocratic ideals that the country's founding fathers envisioned in his book "India After Gandhi"<sup>42</sup>. Although the reservation system was intended to advance equality and social justice, he contends that it has also sparked concerns about meritocracy and the possibility of reverse discrimination.

---

<sup>40</sup> Insights into Editorial: The key to revitalising India's reservation system. <https://www.insightsonindia.com/2021/09/09/insights-into-editorial-the-key-to-revitalising-indias-reservation-system/>. [Accessed, 2<sup>nd</sup> of December 2023],[23:40]

<sup>41</sup> Reservation Policy in India - A Detailed Analysis - Law Corner. <https://lawcorner.in/reservation-policy-in-india-a-detailed-analysis/>. [Accessed, 2<sup>nd</sup> of December 2023],[23:45]

<sup>42</sup> Guha, R. (2007). India After Gandhi: The History of the World's Largest Democracy.

The debate around reservations has turned into a battlefield where conflicting interests meet. Firstly, some contend that to address historical injustices and advance social equity, reserves should be kept in place and expanded<sup>43</sup>. They use the ongoing social and economic divides between various caste groups as evidence to support the policy.

Conversely, some contend that the meritocracy ideal is compromised by the reservation system, which may also result in inefficiencies and resentment. They argue that reservations may inhibit merit and diligence and foster a feeling of entitlement and complacency among the privileged groups.

Additionally, political scheming has been used to manipulate the reservation system. The reservation strategy has frequently been employed by political parties as a means of securing vote banks<sup>44</sup>. This has worsened the situation and sparked further disputes. talk about reservations.

The rhetoric around reservations also heavily incorporates historical grievances. In India, the caste system's historical injustices and socioeconomic inequities led to the introduction of the reservation system<sup>45</sup>. However, there have been several difficulties and disagreements with the reservation system's implementation.

These continuing discussions and disputes have influenced the direction that reservation rules have taken in India. The reservation system has had several adjustments over time in response to the shifting political, social, and economic environments. Social justice, meritocracy, historical grievances, political interests, and policy problems all play a multifaceted role in the conversation around reservations in India. It's a subject that always stirs up strong feelings and lively discussion. The discussion of reservations is expected to continue to play a significant role in the sociopolitical landscape of India as long as the country struggles with challenges of social injustice and works to realise the values of justice and equality contained in its Constitution.

---

<sup>43</sup> Reservation in India: Controversy, Justification and Criticism. <https://www.yourarticlelibrary.com/reservation-system/reservation-in-india-controversy-justification-and-criticism/47114>. [Accessed, 2<sup>nd</sup> of December 2023],[23:50]

<sup>44</sup>Competing Inequalities: The Scheduled Tribes and the Reservations .... <https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/journal-of-asian-studies/article/abs/competing-inequalities-the-scheduled-tribes-and-the-reservations-system-in-indias-> [Accessed, 2<sup>nd</sup> of December 2023],[23:50]

<sup>45</sup> The Concept, Origin And Evaluation Of Reservation Policy In India. <https://www.legalserviceindia.com/legal/article-6526-the-concept-origin-and-evaluation-of-reservation-policy-in-india.html>. [Accessed, 2<sup>nd</sup> of December 2023],[23:36]

## CONCLUSION

It is clear from handling the complex reservation discussion in India that a thoughtful and nuanced approach is essential. The necessity of handling the challenges with both sensitivity and practicality is highlighted by the historical underpinnings and continuous quest of social justice. Reservations have been crucial in correcting historical wrongs, but issues like possible stigmatisation and worries about meritocracy must be addressed.

### **Suggestion:**

**Comprehensive changes:** Beyond merely imposing numerical quotas, authorities urgently need to take into account comprehensive changes. A more successful and long-lasting strategy may be paved with initiatives that emphasise skill development, educational empowerment, and fostering an inclusive atmosphere.

**Inclusive Dialogue:** It's critical to promote candid, inclusive conversations with members of the entire community. Creating agreement via A sense of togetherness and understanding may be fostered by having meaningful talks that help close gaps and debunk harmful stereotypes.

**Adaptation to Changing Dynamics:** Reservation policies should change to meet the evolving requirements of society, given the dynamic character of socio-political environments. In order to guarantee that these policies keep favourably impacting the advancement of the country, flexibility and adaptation will be essential.

Adopting these recommendations might help India create a more peaceful and just society in the future, where social justice and inclusiveness become national values rather than merely set of laws.